Improving the Quality of Spiritual Care

Betty Ferrell, PhD, MA, FAAN, FPCN, CHPN
Director and Professor
City of Hope
Duarte, CA

Supported by the Archstone Foundation, Long Beach, CA. as a part of their End-of-Life Initiative.

Executive Summary published in the *Journal of Palliative Medicine*, October 2009
No Potential Conflict of Interest to Declare

I do not currently have an affiliation (financial or otherwise) with a commercial entity.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>The Project Team</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>City of Hope National Medical Center, Duarte, CA</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Betty R. Ferrell, PhD, MA, FAAN, FPCN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-Principal Investigator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Scientist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rose Virani, RNC, MHA, OCN, FPCN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Research Specialist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev. Cassie McCarty, MDiv, BCC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spiritual Care Consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>George Washington Institute for Spirituality and Health, Washington, DC</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christina Puchalski, MD, MS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-Principal Investigator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive Director, GWish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor of Medicine and Hlth &amp; Sci</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Washington University SOM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janet Bull, MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Director</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The goal of palliative care is to prevent and relieve suffering (NCP, 2009)

Palliative Care supports the best possible quality of life for patients and their families (NCP, 2009)

Palliative care is viewed as applying to patients from the time of diagnosis of serious illness to death
Consensus Conference Goal

• Identify points of agreement about spirituality as it applies to health care

• Make recommendations to advance the delivery of quality spiritual care in palliative care

• 5 Key Elements of Spiritual Care provided the framework: spiritual assessment; models of care and care plans; interprofessional team training; quality improvement; and personal and professional development
The NCP Guidelines Address Eight Domains of Care:

- Structure and Processes;
- Physical Aspects;
- Psychological and Psychiatric Aspects;
- Social Aspects;
- Spiritual, Religious, and Existential Aspects;
- Cultural Aspects;
- Imminent Death; and
- Ethical and Legal Aspects.
### National Consensus Project Guidelines and National Quality Forum Preferred Practices for the Spiritual Domain

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National Consensus Project Guidelines</th>
<th>National Quality Forum Preferred Practices</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guideline 5.1</td>
<td>DOMAIN 5.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spiritual and existential dimensions are assessed and responded to based upon the best available evidence, which is skillfully and systematically applied.</td>
<td>SPIRITUAL, RELIGIOUS, AND EXISTENTIAL ASPECTS OF CARE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PREFERRED PRACTICE 20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Develop and document a plan based on assessment of religious, spiritual, and existential concerns using a structured instrument and integrate the information obtained from the assessment into the palliative care plan.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PREFERRED PRACTICE 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Provide information about the availability of spiritual care services and make spiritual care available either through organizational spiritual counseling or through the patient’s own clergy relationships.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PREFERRED PRACTICE 22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Specialized palliative and hospice care teams should include spiritual care professionals appropriately trained and certified in palliative care.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PREFERRED PRACTICE 23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Specialized palliative and hospice spiritual care professional should build partnerships with community clergy and provide education and counseling related to end-of-life care.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Consensus Conference Design and Organization

- 40 national leaders representing physicians, nurses, psychologists, social workers, chaplains and clergy, other spiritual care providers, and healthcare administrators
- Develop a consensus-driven definition of spirituality
- Make recommendations to improve spiritual care in palliative care settings
- Identify resources to advance the quality of spiritual care
Consensus Conference (Cont’d)

- First draft prepared by investigators and advisors.
- Draft sent to conference participants pre course.
- Consensus Conference included plenary sessions and working groups with facilitators in one of five identified key areas of spiritual care.
A Consensus Definition of Spirituality was Developed:

“Spirituality is the aspect of humanity that refers to the way individuals seek and express meaning and purpose and the way they experience their connectedness to the moment, to self, to others, to nature, and to the significant or sacred.”
Post Conference Work Included:

- Synthesis of feedback from small group sessions
- Course evaluations
- Revised Consensus Report was reviewed by the conferences participants, the Advisors and a panel of peer reviewers with a total of 91 reviews submitted
• Final Consensus Report published in Journal of Palliative Medicine, October 2009

• Book published 2010
Recommendations for improving spiritual care are divided into seven key areas:

I. Spiritual Care Models
II. Spiritual Assessment
III. Spiritual Treatment/Care Plans
IV. Interprofessional Team
V. Training/Certification
VI. Personal and Professional Development
VII. Quality Improvement

Conference Recommendations
I. Spiritual Care Models

**Recommendations**

- Integral to any patient-centered health care system
- Based on honoring dignity
- Spiritual distress treated the same as any other medical problem
- Spirituality should be considered a “vital sign”
- Interdisciplinary
Inpatient Spiritual Care Implementation Model

Clinicians and Spiritual care providers

Key

Clinicians: Chaplains, doctors, nurses, social workers
Community providers: community religious leaders, spiritual director, pastoral and community counselors, faith community nurses, PT/OT and others

Puchalski, Handzo, Wintz, and Buhl, 2009
Outpatient Spiritual Care Implementation Model

Patient

Spiritual history (MD/NP)

Re-eval

Patient process

Transformative interaction

Interprofessional collaboration

Clinicians and spiritual care providers

Clinicians: Chaplains, doctors, nurses, social workers
Community providers: Community religious leaders, spiritual director, pastoral and community counselors, faith community nurses, PT/OT and others

Community providers; Family & Friends

Outcomes

Re-eval

Community providers; Family & Friends

Personal and professional Preparation

Referral to Chaplain or spiritual care

Treatment Plan

Puchalski, Handro, Witz, and Bull, 2009
II. Spiritual Assessment of Patients and Families

**Recommendations**

- Spiritual screening
- Assessment tools
- All staff members should be trained to recognize spiritual distress
- HCP’s should incorporate spiritual screening as a part of routine history/evaluation
- Formal screening by Board Certified Chaplain
- Documentation
- Follow-up
- Response within 24 hours
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Diagnoses (Primary)</th>
<th>Key feature from history</th>
<th>Example Statements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Existential</td>
<td>Lack of meaning / questions meaning about one’s own existence / Concern about afterlife / Questions the meaning of suffering / Seeks spiritual assistance</td>
<td>“My life is meaningless”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“I feel useless”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abandonment God or others</td>
<td>lack of love, loneliness / Not being remembered / No Sense of Relatedness</td>
<td>“God has abandoned me”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“No one comes by anymore”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anger at God or others</td>
<td>Displaces anger toward religious representatives / Inability to Forgive</td>
<td>“Why would God take my child…its not fair”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concerns about relationship with deity</td>
<td></td>
<td>“I want to have a deeper relationship with God”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflicted or challenged belief systems</td>
<td>Verbalizes inner conflicts or questions about beliefs or faith</td>
<td>“I am not sure if God is with me anymore”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despair / Hopelessness</td>
<td>Hopelessness about future health, life</td>
<td>“Life is being cut short”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Despair as absolute hopelessness, no hope for value in life</td>
<td>“There is nothing left for me to live for”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grief/pass</td>
<td>Grief is the feeling and process associated with a loss of person, health, etc</td>
<td>“I miss my loved one so much”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“I wish I could run again”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guilt/shame</td>
<td>Guilt is feeling that the person has done something wrong or evil; shame is a feeling that the person is bad or evil</td>
<td>“I do not deserve to die pain-free”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconciliation</td>
<td>Need for forgiveness and/or reconciliation of self or others</td>
<td>I need to be forgiven for what I did</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I would like my wife to forgive me</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isolation</td>
<td>From religious community or other</td>
<td>“Since moving to the assisted living I am not able to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>go to my church anymore”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious specific</td>
<td>Ritual needs / Unable to practice in usual religious practices</td>
<td>“I just can’t pray anymore”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious / Spiritual Struggle</td>
<td>Loss of faith and/or meaning / Religious or spiritual beliefs and/or community not helping with coping</td>
<td>“What if all that I believe is not true”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Recommendations

- Screen & Access
- All HCPs should do spiritual screening
- Diagnostic labels/codes
- Treatment plans
- Support/encourage in expression of needs and beliefs
III. Formulation of a Spiritual Treatment Plan (cont’d)

- Spiritual care coordinator
- Documentation of spiritual support resources
- Follow up evaluations
- Treatment algorithms
- Discharge plans of care
- Bereavement care
- Establish procedure
Intervention – HCP / Pt. Communication

- Compassionate presence
- Reflective listening/query about important life events
- Support patient sources of spiritual strength
- Open ended questions
- Inquiry about spiritual beliefs, values and practices
- Life review, listening to the patient’s story
- Targeted spiritual intervention
- Continued presence and follow up
Intervention – Simple Spiritual Therapy

- Guided visualization for “meaningless pain”
- Progressive relaxation
- Meaning-oriented-therapy
- Referral to spiritual care provider as indicated
- Narrative Medicine
- Dignity-conserving therapy

Artwork by Nathalie Parenteau
Intervention – Patient Self-Care

- Massage
- Reconciliation with self and/or others
- Join spiritual support groups
- Meditation
- Religious or sacred spiritual readings or rituals
- Books
- Yoga, Tai Chi
- Exercise
- Engage in the arts (music, art, dance including therapy, classes etc)
- Journaling
Recommendations

- Policies are needed
- Policies developed by clinical sites
- Create healing environments
- Respect of HCPs reflected in policies
- Document assessment of patient needs
- Need for Board Certified Chaplains
- Workplace activity/programs to enhance spirit
V. Training and Certification

Recommendations

• All members of the team should be trained in spiritual care
• Team members should have training in spiritual self-care
• Administrative support for professional development
• Spiritual care education/support
• Clinical site education
• Development of certification/training
• Competencies
• Interdisciplinary models
VI. Personal and Professional Development

**Recommendations**

- Healthcare settings/organizations should support HCP’s attention to self-care/stress management
  - training/orientation
  - staff meetings/educational programs
  - environmental aesthetics
- Spiritual development
  - resources
  - continuing education
  - clinical context
VI. Personal and Professional Development (cont’d)

- Time encouraged for self-examination
- Opportunities for sense of connectedness and community
  > interprofessional teams
  > ritual and reflections
  > staff support
- Discussion of ethical issues
  > power imbalances
  > virtual based approach
  > opportunity to discuss
VII. Quality Improvement

Recommendations

- Domain of spiritual care to be included in QI plans
- Assessment tools
- QI frameworks based on NCP Guidelines
- QI specific to spiritual care
- Research needed
- Funding needed for research and clinical services
Go to: http://prc.coh.org
Go to: www.gwish.org
Next Steps…

SPRITUAL CARE DEMONSTRATION PROJECTS (OCT 2010-SEPT 2012)

- 9 Competitively Selected Southern California Hospitals
- Four Target Areas
- Conference calls and convening (2x/year)
- Mentoring
- External evaluation
- Document models and advance best care practices
Conclusion

• Spiritual care is essential to improving quality palliative care as determined by the National Consensus Project (NCP) and National Quality Forum (NQF)

• Studies have indicated the strong desire of patients with serious illness and end-of-life concerns to have spirituality included in their care
• Recommendations are provided for the implementation of spiritual care in palliative, hospice, hospital, long-term, and other clinical settings

• Interprofessional care that includes board-certified chaplains on the care team

• Regular ongoing assessment of patients’ spiritual issues

• Integration of patient spirituality into the treatment plan with appropriate follow-up with ongoing quality improvement

• Professional education and development of programs

• Adoption of these recommendations into clinical site policies
Conclusion (cont’d)

- Clinical sites can integrate spiritual care models into their programs
- Develop interprofessional training programs
- Engage community clergy and spiritual leaders in the care of patients and families
- Promote professional development that incorporates a biopsychosocial-spiritual practice model
- Develop accountability measures to ensure that spiritual care is fully integrated into the care of patients